

## History of Logic from Aristotle to Gödel

by Raul Corazzon | e-mail: rc@ontology.co

### Ancient Stoicism: The Editions of Fragments and *Testimonia*

#### EDITIONS AND TRANSLATIONS

1. Arnim, Hans Friedrich August von, ed. 1903. *Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta*. Stuttgart: Teubner. Reprint: München, Leipzig: K.G. Sauri, 2004.  
Vol. I: *Zeno et Zenonis discipuli* (1905); Vol. II: *Chrysippi Fragmenta logica et physica* (1903); Vol. III: *Chrysippi Fragmenta moralia -- Fragmenta successorum Chrysippi* (1903); Vol. IV: *Indices conscripsit Maximilianus Adler* (1924).
2. Hülser, Karlheinz, ed. 1987. *Die Fragmente Zur Dialektik Der Stoiker*. Stuttgart: Frommann-Holzboog. Neue Sammlung der Texte mit deutscher Übersetzung und Kommentaren (4 Bände).  
I: *Fragmente 1-368* (1987) ; II: *Fragmente 369-772* (1987) ; III: *Fragmente 773-1074* (1987) ; IV: *Fragmente 1075-1257* (1988).  
[ *My translation of the*] Overview of Contents: Preface XIX; Introduction by the Editor XXIII; Annexes I-II LXXVIII; 1. Introduction: The dialectic in the context of the Stoic philosophy (Fragments No. 1-254) 2; 1.1 Philosophy and its division in Logic, Ethics, Physics (No. 1-32a) 2; 1.2 Exclusion and further determination of Dialectic (Nos. 33-98). 40; 1.3 On the origin, development and reception of Stoic dialectic (No. 99-254) 102; 2. Theory of Knowledge (Epistemology) (No. 255-473) 248; 2.1 Unity and diversity of representations (ideas) (No. 259-281) 260; 2.2 On sensory perception and on the Concept (No. 282-321). 296; 2.3 The criteria of truth (No. 322-362) 332; 2.4 Assent, knowledge and science (No. 363-419) 392; 2.5 Digression: On the Soul (No. 420-456) 454; 2.6 Theoretical Sciences (No. 457-473) 486; 3. About the linguistic sign (No. 474-680) 516; 3.1 Successive determination of the speech according to the sound (No. 476-535) 520; 3.2 The parts of speech (word classes) (No. 536-593) 592; 3.3 Advantages and faults of speech. Poetics (No. 594-620) 672; 3.4 Linguistic characters in relation to their meaning (No. 621-680) 714; 4. About the meanings (No. 681-1257) 790; 4.1 Terminology (No. 681-694) 790; 4.2 The Lekta (sayable) in general. The incomplete Lekta and the categories (No. 695-873) 806; 4.3 The full Lekta (no. 874-913) 1086; 4.4 The classifications of the statement (No. 914-1035) 1140; 4.5 The theory of argument (No. 1036-1198a) 1364; 4.6 The fallacies (no. 1199-1257) 1690; Indexes I-VIII 1787.
3. Schmidt, Rudolf Traugott. 1839. *Stoicorum Grammatica*. Halle. Dissertation presented at the University of Halle. Reprint: Amsterdam, Hakkert, 1967.
4. ———. 1979. *Die Grammatik Der Stoiker*. Braunschweig / Wiesbaden: Vieweg. German translation of R. T. Schmidt's *Grammatica stoicorum* edited and introduced by Karlheinz Hülser; with an annotated bibliography on Stoic dialectic by Urs Egli.
5. Baldassarri, Mariano. 1984. *La Logica Stoica. Testimonianze E Frammenti*. Como: Litotipografia Malinverno.  
Testi originali con introduzione e traduzione commentata. (Otto volumi in dieci tomi. Il nono volume: a) *Indice terminologico*; b) *Bibliografia sui testi e sugli studi*; *Conclusione critica sulle interpretazioni della logica stoica*, non è mai stato pubblicato).  
I. Introduzione alla logica stoica (1984); II. Crisippo: il catalogo degli scritti e i frammenti dai papiri (1985); III. Diogene Laerzio (Dalle *Vite dei filosofi VII*) (1986); IV. Sesto Empirico (Dai *Lineamenti pirroniani II*, Dal *Contro i matematici VIII*) (1986); Va. Alessandro di Afrodisia (Dal *Commento agli Analitici primi*, Dal *Commento ai Topici*) (1986); Vb. Plotino, i Commentatori aristotelici tardi, Boezio (1987); VI. Cicerone (Testi dal *Lucullus*, dal *De Fato*, dai *Topica*) (1986); VIIa. Galeno (Dalla *Introduzione alla dialettica*) (1986); VIIb. Le Testimonianze minori del sec. II. d.C.: Epitteto, Plutarco, Gellio, Apuleio (1987); VIII. *Testimonianze sparse ordinate sistematicamente* (1987).  
"Il presente lavoro tenta una ricostruzione sintetica della logica stoica considerata nei suoi rapporti storici e nella sua cornice sistematica: non è pertanto una interpretazione della logica stoica nella prospettiva

della logica moderna né propriamente una esposizione di un momento della storia della logica, bensì intenderebbe presentare un momento della storia della filosofia.

In particolare, esso nasce da un decennale contatto con tutte le fonti antiche relative alla logica stoica e vuole introdurre alla lettura di tali fonti. I testi di Crisippo, di Diogene Laerzio, di Sesto Empirico, dei commentatori di Aristotele (innanzitutto di Alessandro di Afrodisia), di Cicerone, degli scrittori del sec. II d.C. che ci informano sulla logica stoica (innanzitutto di Galeno) sono stati raccolti, ordinati per autore e vagliati, nonché tradotti e commentati; sono state anche raccolte e ordinate secondo il contenuto secondo il quale si sviluppa l'esposizione nel presente lavoro le testimonianze che si trovano sparse nei più vari autori (anche negli autori che si potrebbero ritenere scarsamente significativi), e sono state anch'esse tradotte e commentate." (Dalla Prefazione al primo volume).

6. Isnardi Parente, Margherita, ed. 1989. *Stoici Antichi*. Torino: Utet.
7. Radice, Roberto, ed. 1998. *Stoici Antichi. Tutti I Frammenti*. Milano: Bompiani.  
Testo greco degli *Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta* di Hans von Armin e traduzione italiana di Roberto Radice.
8. Schuhl, Pierre-Maxime, ed. 1962. *Les Stoiciens*. Paris: Gallimard.  
Textes choisis et traduits par Émile Bréhier et édités sous la direction de Pierre-Maxime Schuhl.
9. Mates, Benson. 1953. *Stoic Logic*. Berkeley: University of California Press.  
Second edition 1961.  
Appendix A. *Translations* 95-131.
10. Long, Arthur A., and Sedley, David N., eds. 1987. *The Hellenistic Philosophers*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.  
Vol. I: Translations of the principal sources, with philosophical commentary; Vol. II: Greek and Latin texts with notes and bibliography.  
On Stoic logic see: Vol. I: *Logic and Semantics*. 31. Dialectic and rhetoric p. 183; 32. Definition and division 190; 33. Sayables ( *lekta*) 195; 34. Simple propositions 202; 35. Non-simple propositions 208; 36. Arguments 212; 37. Fallacy 220; 38. Modality 230-236.
11. Inwood, Brad, and Gerson, Lloyd P., eds. 1997. *Hellenistic Philosophy. Introductory Readings*. Indianapolis: Hackett.  
Second expanded edition (first edition 1988).  
Chapter II. *Stoicism* pp. 103-260; see in particular the section *Logic and Theory of Knowledge* pp. 111-131.
12. ———, eds. 2008. *The Stoics Reader. Selected Writings and Testimonia*. Indianapolis: Hackett.  
See *Logic and Theory of Knowledge* pp. 11-24.

## A SELECTION OF THE MAIN SOURCES ON STOIC DIALECTIC

1. Diogenes, Laertii. 1964. *Vitae Philosophorum*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.  
Critical edition of the Greek text by Herbert Strain Long.  
See the Book VII: *Zeno, Ariston, Herillus, Dionysius, Cleanthes, Sphaerus, Chrysippus*.
2. Diogenes, Laërtius. 1925. *Lives of Eminent Philosophers*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.  
Translated by R. D. Hicks with the Greek text facing.  
Reprint with an introduction by Herbert Strain Long, 1972.
3. Diogène, Laërce. 2006. *Vies Et Doctrines Des Stoïciens*. Paris: LGF.  
Traduction, introduction, notes de commentaire, bibliographie, index de Richard Goulet.
4. Filodemo. 1994. *Storia Dei Filosofi: La Stoà Da Zenone a Panezio (Pherc. 1018)*. Leiden: Brill.  
Edizione, traduzione e commento a cura di Tiziano Dorandi.
5. Mutschmann, Hermann, and Mau, Jürgen, eds. 1912. *Sexti Empirici Opera*. Leipzig: Teubner.  
Vol. I: *Pyrroneion hypotyposeon libri tres* (1912); Vol. II: *Adversus dogmaticos libri quinque ( Adv. mathem. VII-XI)* (1914); Vol. III: *Adversus mathematicos libri I-VI* (1954) ed. J. Mau.  
Vol. IV: Indices ad vol. I-III adiecit Karel Janáček (1962).
6. Sextus, Empiricus. 2005. *Against the Logicians*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.  
Edited and translated by Richard Bett.  
Contents: Acknowledgments VI; Abbreviations VII; Introduction IX; Chronological table XXXI; Further reading XXXII; Note on the text and translation XXXV; Outline of argument XXXVIII; Against the Logicians 1. Book 1 3; Book 2 90; Glossary 184; Parallels between *Against the Logicians* and other

- works of Sextus 193; Names referred to in *Against the Logicians* 196; Subject index 205.
7. Galenus. 1896. *Galenus Institutio Logica*. Leipzig: Teubner.
  8. ———. 1964. *Galen's Institutio Logica*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press.  
English translation, introduction and commentary by John Spangler Kieffer.
  9. Galien. 1998. *Traité Philosophiques Et Logiques*. Paris: Flammarion.  
Le volume contient cinq traités de Claude Galien: 1. *Des textes pour les débutants*; 2. *Esquisse empirique*; 3. *De l'expérience médicale*; 4. *Des sophismes verbaux*; 5. *Institution logique*.  
Traduction de Jean-Pierre Levet.
  10. Edlow, Robert Blair. 1977. *Galen on Language and Ambiguity*. Leiden: Brill.  
An English Translation of Galen's '*De Captationibus (On Fallacies)*' with Introduction, Text and Commentary.  
see in particular Chapter VII: *The Stoics on Fallacy and Ambiguity*, pp. 56-68.
  11. Londey, David, and Johanson, Carmen, eds. 1987. *The Logic of Apuleius*. Leiden: Brill.  
Including a complete Latin text and English translation of the *Peri Hermeneias* of Apuleius of Madara.
  12. Pearson, Alfred Chilton. 1891. *The Fragments of Zeno and Cleanthes*. London: C. J. Clay & Sons.
  13. Arnim, Hans Friedrich August von, ed. 1905. *Zeno Et Zenonis Discipuli*. Stuttgart: Teubner.  
Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta: Vol. I.
  14. Watanabe, Albert Tohru. 1988. *Cleanthes Fragments: Text and Commentary*.  
Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation available at ProQuest Dissertation Express n. AAT 8908885.
  15. Thom, Johan Carl. 2005. *Cleanthes' Hymn to Zeus*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.  
Text, translation, and commentary.
  16. Arnim, Hans Friedrich August von, ed. 1903. *Chrysippi Fragmenta Logica Et Physica*. Stuttgart: Teubner.  
Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta: Vol. II.
  17. Crönert, Wilhelm. 1901. "Die Logika Zetemata Des Chrysippus Und Die Übrigen Papyri Logischen Inhalts Aus Der Herculansischen Bibliothek." *Hermes* no. 36:548-579.  
Traduzione italiana di Enrico Livrea in: W. Croenert, *Studi Ercolanesi*, Napoli, Morano, 1975 pp. 63-101.
  18. Del Mastro, Gianluca. 2005. "Il *Pherc. 1380*: Crisippo, *Opera Logica*." *Cronache Ercolanesi* no. 35:61-70.  
"Analisi paleografica di *PHERC. 1380* e ricostruzione della *subscriptio*: si tratta dell'opera "Degli elementi del discorso e della frase" di Crisippo, di argomento logico-dialettico, affine per tema al trattato sulle ambiguità del linguaggio tramandato in *PHERC. 307*."
  19. Marrone, Livia. 1997. "Le *Questioni Logiche* Di Crisippo (*Pherc. 307*)." *Cronache Ercolanesi* no. 27:83-100.  
Critical edition and Italian translation of Chrysippus' work *Logika zetemata* (Investigations in logic) found in the Herculaneum Papyrus 307.
  20. ———. 1982. "Nuove Letture Nel *Pherc. 307* (*Questioni Logiche* Di Crisippo)." *Cronache Ercolanesi* no. 12:13-18.
  21. Chrysippe. 2004. *œuvre Philosophique*. Paris: Les Belles Lettres.  
Édition bilingue (textes grecs et latins, traduction française). Textes traduits et commentés par Richard Dufour.  
Table des matières.  
Tome I: Remerciements IX; Avant-propos XI; Introduction XV; Avertissement LIII; Sur la vie de Chrysippe et témoignages sur ses écrits, n. 1-31 p. 1; Prolégomènes à la philosophie, n. 32-42 p. 43;  
PREMIÈRE PARTIE. LA LOGIQUE (n. 43-51) p. 57.  
Chapitre I. La doctrine de la connaissance (n. 52-112) p. 69; Chapitre II. La dialectique (n. 113-295) p. 141; Chapitre III. La Rhétorique (n. 296-306) p. 391;  
DEUXIÈME PARTIE: LA PHYSIQUE p. 401.  
Chapitre I. Les doctrines fondamentales de la physique (n. 307-535) p. 403;  
Liste des ouvrages de Chrysippe 661; Glossaire 665; Chronologie des écoles philosophiques 673; Bibliographie 675-685.  
Tome II: Chapitre II. sur le monde (n. 536-647) p. 9; Chapitre III. Des corps célestes et des phénomènes atmosphériques (n. 648-707) p. 109; Chapitre IV: Des animaux et des plantes (n. 708-772) p. 157; Chapitre V. De l'âme humaine (n. 773-913) p. 206; Chapitre VI. Sur le destin (n. 914-1014) p. 355; Chapitre VII. Sur la nature des dieux (n. 1015-1110) p. 485; Chapitre VIII. Sur la providence et la nature artiste (n. 1111-1166) p. 567; Chapitre IX. Sur la divination (n. 1167-1195) p. 621; Repères chronologiques des citateurs 649; Bibliographie des citateurs 651; Index des notions 671; Index des

- passages cités 679; Index des personnages 705; Concordances: ce recueil-Long & Sedley 717; Concordances: ce recueil-SVF 719; Concordances: Long & Sedley-ce recueil 729; Concordances: SVF-ce recueil 733-743.
22. Posidonius. 1972. *The Fragments*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.  
Vol. I.  
See Fragments 42. *On Criterion*; 43. *On General Enquiry Against Hermagora*; 44. *Introduction to Style*; 45. *On Conjunctions*; and 188. *Dialectic: definition*; 189. *Rhetoric, Classification of status*; 190. *Cause*; 191. *Relationa syllogisms*; 192. *Grammar: etymology*; 193. *Etymology of Sight*; 194. *Sight*.
  23. ———. 1988. *The Commentary. Fragments 1-149*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.  
Vo. II.1.  
See Commentary to Fragments 42-45 (pp. 189-204).
  24. ———. 1988. *The Commentary. Fragments 150-293*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.  
Vol. II.2.  
See Commentary to Fragments 188-194 (pp. 684-698).
  25. ———. 1999. *The Translation of the Fragments*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.  
Vol. III.

## STOIC LEXICON

Lexicon IV: *Stoics*, Edited by Roberto Radice in collaboration with Lucia Palpacelli, Chiara Pisoni, Ilaria Ramelli, Laura Stochino, Francesca Scrivani and Emmanuele Vimercati. Electronic edition by Roberto Bombacigno, Milano: Biblia 2007, 4 vols. (4040 p.) 1 CD-ROM + License.  
Complete edition in the original language, index lemmatized, (also available on CD-ROM) of the works of the Stoic philosophers, Greek and Latin.

## BIBLIOGRAPHIES ON STOICISM

1. Egli, Urs. 1979. "Bibliographie Zur Stoischen Sprachwissenschaft (Dialektik)." In *Die Grammatik Der Stoiker*, 182-216. Braunschweig: Vierweg & Sohn.  
Appendix to the German translation by Karlheinz Hülser of: Rudolf Traugott Schmidt, *Stoicorum grammatica*, Halle, 1839.
2. Epp, Ronald H. 1985. Stoicism Bibliography. In *Southern Journal of Philosophy*  
Recovering the Stoics. Spindel Conference 1984.  
1169 titles.  
"This bibliography cites the most important secondary literature on Stoic philosophy. It is not exhaustive in part because the term Stoic has such a bastardized legacy.  
What has been selected are important contributions to the Stoic tradition as theory and practice. This literature is concentrated in a half dozen modern European languages accessible to English language scholars, and is largely confined to the twentieth century.  
A generous sense of what is philosophical has been employed; works that are exclusively historical, philological, or literary have been excluded. The following forms of scholarship were generally ignored: (a) primary sources, translations, and commentaries, (b) encyclopedia and dictionary entries, (c) dissertations, (d) book reviews, and (e) standard histories.  
Several oddities should be noted. All serials titled by a single term (e.g. *Phronesis*) will be fully cited, whereas multi-term serials (e.g. *Classical Quarterly*) are abbreviated according to *L'Annee Philologique*, and listed here with other serials on pages 126-131. Since rules of capitalization are varied, I have favored a minimalist approach, and when the work of a single author is collected (e.g. Max Pohlenz's *Kleine Schriften*), a single citation replaces the separate citations contained therein. Indexes of key English and selected Greek subjects complete user access to this bibliography, and regrettably indexes to Latin terms and the primary literature could not be included." (From the Preface by R. H. Epp).
3. Baldassarri, Mariano. 1993. "Logica Stoica: Bibliografia." In *Studi Di Filosofia Antica Ii*, 139-172.  
Como: Libreria Nosedà.
4. Steinmetz, Peter. 1994. "Die Stoa." In *Die Philosophie Der Antike. Band 4: Die Hellenistische Philosophie*, edited by Flashar, Hellmut, 491-716. Basel: Schwabe & Co.  
Inhalt: Vorbemerkung 491; 33. Die Stoa bis zum Beginn der römischen Kaiserzeit im allgemeinen 495; 34.

Zenon aus Kition 518; 35. Die Schüler Zenons (I). Persaios aus Kition, Philonides aus Theben, Dionysios aus Herakleia, Ariston aus Chios, Hérillos aus Kalchedon 555; 36. Die Schüler Zenons (II). Kleanthes und Sphairon 566; 37. Chrysippus Soloi 584; 38. Schüler und Nachfolger Chrysipps 626; 39. Panaitios aus Rhodos und seine Schüler 646; 40. Poseidonios aus Apameia 670; 41. Die Stoa in der Mitte und zweiten Hälfte des 1. Jahrhunderts von Christus 706-716.

5. Gourinat, Jean-Baptiste. 2000. *La Dialectique Des Stoiciens*. Paris: Vrin.  
Bibliographie: *Textes antiques* 335-341; *Textes modernes* 341-357.
6. ———. 2005. "Bibliographie D'orientation." In *Les Stoiciens*, edited by Romeyer Dherbey, Gilbert and Gourinat, Jean-Baptiste, 545-572. Paris: Vrin.
7. "Bibliographie Complémentaire." In. 2006. *Les Stoïciens Et Leur Logique*, edited by Brunshwig, Jacques, 475-484. Paris: Vrin.  
Actes du Colloque de Chantilly 18-22 septembre 1976.  
Première édition 1978; deuxième édition, revue, augmentée et mise à jour (reproduit la pagination de l'édition originale).  
"Nous n'avons pas reproduit dans ce volume la bibliographie de la première édition, qui aurait rendu celle-ci pléthorique; nous avons donc laissé à leur place, et sous leur forme initiale, toutes les références antérieures à 1976, *telles qu'elles se trouvent dans le texte et dans les notes des articles eux-mêmes*. En revanche, nous regroupons ici, par ordre alphabétique des noms des auteurs, les références complètes des études qui ont été mentionnées, sous forme abrégée, dans les compléments apportés aux textes et aux notes par les auteurs et réviseurs de la présente deuxième édition; nous y ajoutons quelques publications récentes particulièrement marquantes. On ne trouvera donc dans ce qui suit, sauf exceptions justifiées par leur importance, que des titres publiés depuis 1976."

## RELATED PAGES

[Index of the Section: History of Logic from Aristotle to Gödel](#)

[The Dialectical \(Megarian\) School and the Origins of Propositional Logic \(under construction\)](#)

[Bibliography on The Dialectical \(Megarian\) School](#)

[Bibliography on the "Master Argument", Diodorus Cronus, Philo the Dialectician](#)

Stoic Logic:

[Stoic Logic: The Dialectic from Zeno to Chrysippus](#)

[The Stoic Doctrine of \*Lekta\* \(Sayables\)](#)

[Second Part: The Rhetoric \(under construction\)](#)

[Stoic Philosophy of Language and Grammar \(under construction\)](#)

Annotated Bibliographies on Ancient Stoicism:

[Stoic Logic. First Part: A - E](#)

[Stoic Logic. Second Part: F - Z](#)

[Early Stoic Logicians: Zeno of Citium, Cleanthes, Chrysippus](#)

[Philosophy of Language, Grammar and Rhetoric](#)

[On the website "Theory and History of Ontology"](#)

[The Stoic Doctrine of \*Supreme Genera\* \(Categories\)](#)

[The Stoic Doctrine of "Something" as Supreme Genus \(under construction\)](#)

[Stoic Theory of Categories](#)

[Stoic Ontology](#)